

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
HELD TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 12, 2019 AT 1:00 P.M. IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY
HALL, MACKINAC ISLAND, MICHIGAN**

Chairman Finkel called a regular meeting of the Mackinac Island Historic District to order at 1:02 p.m.

PRESENT: Andrew Doud, Alan Sehoan, Lee Finkel, Nancy Porter

ABSENT: Lorna Straus

STAFF: Zoning Administrator, Dennis Dombroski, Architect, Richard Neumann, Attorney, Gary Rentrop

Motion by Doud, seconded by Sehoan to approve as written, and place on file the minutes of the regular meeting Tuesday, October 8, 2019. All in favor. Motion carries.

Motion to approve as amended, and place on file the Agenda. Amendments include adding "State Park Communication" to *Correspondence*, adding "Biddle House" to *Old Business*, and adding "Mimi Cunningham Rip Rap" to *New Business*. All in favor. Motion carries.

CORRESPONDENCE

• **State Park Commission**

Rentrop stated that the State Park determined that there is a statute that trumps the HDC statute regarding reviewing projects in an historic district. Phil Porter and Gary Rentrop agreed that the State Park will keep the HDC informed, as a courtesy, of projects taking place in an historic district.

• **Letter from Gary Rentrop re: Health Concerns from 5G**

Rentrop summarized his letter. Finkel stated he is interested in the topic, but is not interested in Mackinac Island being the lead case on the matter. Doud asked if more money will be spent on this topic. Rentrop stated that at this time there isn't anything more to do, but he does expect more work will probably have to be done down the road. He further said that he hopes to piggy back other communities to keep the costs lower. Sehoan wondered why wireless companies were interested in our small island. Dombroski stated he suspects it is political forces on the island driving the issue.

• **Rentrop Statement September 10, 2019**

Rentrop summarized his bill.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

- None

STAFF REPORTS

The following Like-for-Like applications received staff approval:

- MD19-001-051(H) Arbib – Park Place Suites Trim Repair
- C19-050-055(H) Porter – Mighty Mac Roof Replacement
- CD19-019-056(H) Raisch – Siding, Trim & Window Replacement
- C19-044-058(H) Benser/Nephew – Chippewa Hotel Roof Replacement
- MD19-021-060(H) Maurer – Carousel Mall Stairwell Replacement
- MD19-021-061(H) Hellis – Roof Repair

An application for a window replacement at Mighty Mac was withdrawn at the table.

Motion by Sehoyan, second by Porter to accept the Staff Report. All in favor. Motion carries.

OLD BUSINESS

- **MD19-026-048(H) Benser/Porter – Gull Building Alteration & Change of Use**

Richard Clements presented a new window drawing, based on the review by Richard Neumann. The transom windows will be shorter than the window submitted in the packet. The transom will replicate the existing window size. Motion by Sehoyan, second by Doud to approve the application. Roll call vote: Ayes: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan. Nays: None. Abstain: Porter. All in favor. Motion carries.

- **C17-055/56-027(H) Benser – Mr. B's Amended Plan**

Neumann stated he had no issues with the amendment. He believes it is appropriate to the overall character of the building. Motion by Sehoyan, second by Doud to approve the amendment as submitted. Roll call vote: Ayes: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Porter. Nays: None. All in favor. Motion carries.

- **Biddle House – Myron Johnson**

Johnson presented drawings to the Commission. The changes being made are: interpretation changes in that the ADA ramp is being moved to the back side of the building, roof replacement, moving the fencing to delineate the Biddle House and the blacksmith shop, and adding a ticket booth. Neumann had concerns with the placement of the ticket booth in that it seemed to block the view of the blacksmith shop. Johnson stated they are working with HopkinsBurns Design Studio to determine the best placement of the booth. Rentrop stated that a new building may fall under HDC review. Doud stated he appreciated the State Park sharing their plans and didn't think it necessary to review a new building. Motion by Doud, seconded by Sehoyan, to place the plans on file. All in favor. Motion carries.

NEW BUSINESS

- **C19-044-057(H) Benser/Nephew – Chippewa Hotel 4th Floor Doors & Siding**

The applicant would like to replace the doorwalls on the 4th floor as well as replace the vinyl siding with cedar siding, on the 4th floor. Porter stated that eventually the entire building would be resided. Neumann submitted a positive review on the project. Motion by Doud, second by Sehoyan to approve the application. Roll call vote: Ayes: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan. Nays: None. Abstain: Porter. All in favor. Motion carries.

- **R319-061-059(H) Gough/Brodeur Stables – Installation of Verizon Equipment**

Judd Chaille, representing Verizon, was present at the meeting. Dombroski described the job as almost like-for-like, but the cabinetry was different enough that Dombroski felt it should be reviewed. Chaille described the work being done as new equipment under the deck, with skirting. There will be no antenna work. One cabinet will be removed, radios are being changed out, surge protectors and splitters will be replaced and lattice with a black board behind it, will be installed on the end of the deck. The equipment will only be visible from the homes' back yard. Neumann stated he was fine with the plan and liked the proposed lattice work. Chaille stated they are also going to paint the deck, which was not holding the paint previously used. Motion by Porter, second by Finkel to approve the application. Roll call vote: Ayes: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Porter. Nays: None. All in favor. Motion carries.

- **2020 Meeting Dates**

Motion by Sehoyan, second by Doud to approve the 2020 meeting dates. Roll call vote: Aye: Doud, Finkel, Sehoyan, Porter. Nays: None. All in favor. Motion carries.

- **Mimi Cunningham Rip Rap Installation – Army Corp of Engineers**

Doud wanted to discuss the necessity to approve rip rap installation in an historic district. Mimi Cunningham is currently working to obtain permits from the Army Corp of Engineers to install rip rap at her home. Doud stated the work is necessary to preserve the island and would the HDC really want to encumber the work? Sehoan and Porter agreed with Doud. Rentrop asked if the HDC might want to comment on the materials used. Motion by Doud, second by Porter to have Dombroski report any rip rap projects to the HDC, in the form of a staff report. Roll call vote: Ayes: Doud, Finkel, Sehoan, Porter. Nays: None. All in favor. Motion carries.

PUBLIC COMMENT

With no further business there was a Motion by Porter, second by Finkel to adjourn the meeting. Meeting was adjourned at 2:05 pm.



Lee Finkel, Chairman



Katie Pereny, Secretary

