

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
HELD TUESDAY, MARCH 10, 2020 AT 1:00 P.M. IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY
HALL, MACKINAC ISLAND, MICHIGAN**

Chairman Finkel called a regular meeting of the Mackinac Island Historic District to order at 1:04 p.m.

PRESENT: Andrew Doud, Lee Finkel, Lorna Straus, Alan Schoyan

ABSENT: Nancy Porter

STAFF: Zoning Administrator, Dennis Dombroski, Architect, Richard Neumann, Attorney, Gary Rentrop

Motion by Straus, seconded by Doud to approve as written, and place on file the minutes of the regular meeting Tuesday, February 11, 2020. All in favor. Motion carries.

Motion by Doud, seconded by Schoyan to approve as amended, and place on file the Agenda. Amendments include "Notice to Communications Service Providers" under *New Business* and "New Historic Districts" under *Correspondence*. All in favor. Motion carries.

CORRESPONDENCE

- **Rentrop Statement January 10, 2020**

Rentrop stated that next month's statement will be substantially larger due to the fact the City has asked him to look into additional historic districts. The bill will be separated out between the Historic District Commission and The City of Mackinac Island.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

- None

STAFF REPORTS

- **MD20-074-008(H) Lapine & Shaffer – Roof Repair**

Dombroski stated this is a like-for-like application to repair the roof over the front of the shop and also replace some rotted siding.

- Rip Rap Projects in Progress:
 1. City boardwalk from Richard Doud's house to the hill at Market Street
 2. Behind Nephew's, Benjamin's and Arbib's continuing from the City work at the fuel tanks.
 3. Mary's Bistro
- Job Status Report – The Commission was happy with the additional column labeled "Started".

OLD BUSINESS

- **C17-055/56-027(H) Mr. B's Amendment – Benser**

Neumann stated he likes the changes made, based on his review. It is a simplified design but still has the increased height and bigger transoms. Neumann recommended the amendment be approved. Straus stated that this case illustrates how important it is to not move too quickly on an approval, and a Two Meeting Issue is sometimes the better way to go and not an uncommon thing for a deliberative body. A Two Meeting Issue is an issue that is initially brought up at a meeting, and it ought not to be voted on at that meeting. Some issues require immediate decisions but if time allows Straus believes the Two Meeting Issue process should be followed. Motion by Schoyan, second by Doud to approve the amendment. All in favor. Motion carries.

NEW BUSINESS• **CD20-016-009(H)****Musser – Shed Relocation Caskey to Hedgecliff**

Neumann stated this is an after the fact application to endorse the relocation of the shed that was at the old Caskey Cottage and moved to Hedgecliff. Neumann felt he did not have enough historical information to do a review. Neumann feels the question for the Commission is whether it is OK to move a building from a historic district to a location outside of the historic district and knowing the history of the shed is important in making that decision. Andrew McGreevy stated that the grounds keeper moved the shed last summer to Hedgecliff before any permits could be pulled. Straus stated she remembered the shed being in existence in the late 1940's or early 1950's because she used to play hide and seek there as a child. Straus believes it makes sense to move the shed as it has no integral relationship to the Caskey Cottage and if it is useful where it is, it should be where it is. Straus further stated that she believes it is the Commissions task to approve whether it could be moved, not its new location. Motion by Straus, second by Sehojan to approve moving the shed from Caskey Cottage to another location owned by the Caskey Cottage owner, outside of a historic district. Rentrop stated that the only time movement of a resource is referred to in the statute is when it is an alternative to demolition. Roll call vote: Ayes: Doud, Finkel, Sehojan, Straus. Nays: None. All in favor. Motion carries.

• **MD20-010-011(H)****City of Mackinac Island – Stuart House Front Door**

Dombroski stated the door is being repaired/rebuilt. It is not like for like because it is changing from the existing door to the original design. There is currently plywood over parts of the door that will be removed and restored to its original look. Straus wanted to know how they knew what the original look was. Dombroski stated that the original look is still there but just covered in plywood. Straus felt the description letter from the applicant should have been more specific. Motion by Sehojan, second by Doud to approve the application. Roll call vote: Ayes: Doud, Finkel, Sehojan, Straus. Nays: None. All in favor. Motion carries.

Sehojan stepped down from the table.

• **C20-032-013(H)****Callewaert – Walk Up Snack Shop on Astor**

Sehojan submitted new drawings based on Neumann's review, to the members. After discussion on contributing versus non-contributing structures, Neumann stated traditionally buildings had a front door and recommended a false front door between the windows. Finkel asked if a false front door was a good idea. After some discussion it was decided it would be better to eliminate the false door and have three windows. Neumann stated he believes the changes are consistent with the historic characteristics of the district. The steps will still be moved to the side of the building. Neumann stated another plus was the removal of the existing awning. Motion by Doud, second by Finkel to approve the application. Roll call vote: Ayes: Doud, Finkel, Straus. Nays: None. All in favor. Motion carries.

Sehojan returned to the table.

- **Notice to Communications Service Providers – Rentrop**

Rentrop explained his handout which are general directions for proposed communications facilities within the City of Mackinac Island. The entire island is subject to federal protection, as a National Landmark. Section 106 and Section 110 approvals are a federal requirement and therefore the City does not have any authority to approve any cell tower until the Section 106 and 110 reviews are completed and approved. Dombroski should submit these directions to any communications applicants. The wording in the statute is “To the maximum extent possible, the historic integrity is to be preserved.” Size, location and design are all influenced by this process. Rentrop recommends the HDC adopt the Notice To Communications Service Providers, which gives the applicants notice that they must go through this review process before the HDC or Planning Commission can take any action.

Rentrop stated that since this Notice has not yet been adopted that the Chippewa application could be reviewed at this meeting. The Commission decided that they would not do an official review but would listen to their presentation.

Rob Lavel addressed the Commission with a summary of the proposed project. Jake Stricker, from Verizon, handed out pictures of the proposed stealth chimney they would like to install on the roof of the Chippewa. This would be a macro site. Finkel asked about microwave transmission. Stricker stated there is no microwave transmission with this equipment. Section 106 approval is expected on May 1, 2020. After further discussion the conversation returned to the Notice To Communications Service Providers.

Dombroski stated that Cloverland is blocking the installation on any of their poles. Rentrop questioned if they had the authority to do that based on the Metro Act. After further discussion there was a Motion by Doud, second by Sehoan to adopt the Notice To Communications Service Providers. Rentrop read the Notice aloud. Roll call vote: Ayes: Doud, Finkel, Sehoan, Straus. Nays: None. All in favor. Motion carries.

Dombroski suggested requiring a hold harmless agreement from Providers that would protect owners that damage fiber going to various sites.

Verizon presented plans to the table for a small cell facility, which is a 45’ pole, at Mission Point. This project will be officially presented once they receive Section 106 approval.

Rentrop stated that he and Tom Evashevski are working on potential additional historic districts, at the request of City Council.

PUBLIC COMMENT

With no further business there was a Motion to adjourn the meeting. Meeting was adjourned at 2:26 pm.



Lee Finkel, Chairman



Katie Pereny, Secretary

