

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE HISTORIC DISTRICT
COMMISSION HELD TUESDAY, APRIL 12, 2022 AT 10:00 A.M. IN THE COUNCIL
CHAMBERS, CITY HALL, MACKINAC ISLAND, MICHIGAN**

Chairman Finkel called a regular meeting of the Mackinac Island Historic District Commission to order at 10:03 a.m.

PRESENT: Lee Finkel, Andrew Doud, Alan Sehoan

ABSENT: Nancy Porter, Lorna Straus

STAFF: Zoning Administrator, Dennis Dombroski, Architect, Richard Neumann (via Zoom), Attorney, Gary Rentrop (via Zoom)

Motion by Sehoan, seconded by Doud to approve as written, and place on file the minutes of the regular meeting Tuesday, March 8, 2022. All in favor. Motion carries.

Motion by Doud, seconded by Sehoan to approve as amended and place on file the Agenda. The amendments were to add "National Register Bulletin 15", "Reconstruction" and "Article 18 of the Zoning Ordinance" to *New Business*. All in favor. Motion carries.

CORRESPONDENCE

- None

COMMITTEE REPORTS

- **Study Committee Update**

Rentrop reported that a revised proposal had been received from Past Perfect. Past Perfect has split the work in to two phases, with the first phase costing \$14,000.00. Phase 1 includes a general inventory of all buildings. Phase 2 is an intensive level survey. Phase 1 is to be done by September 15, 2022 and Phase 2 by June of 2023.

STAFF REPORTS

- **MD22-012-013(H) Lapine/Shaffer Like-for-Like Roof Replacement**

Dombroski stated the roof shingles needed to be replaced. The applicant is replacing 3 tab shingles with architectural shingles. Motion by Doud, second by Sehoan to approve the Staff Report. All in favor. Motion carries.

OLD BUSINESS

- **Contributing and Non-Contributing Definitions**

Neumann stated that process by which a building is considered eligible for the National Register is what is stated in the National Register Bulletin 15. The criteria in the Bulletin is what determines contributing or non-contributing. Doud asked for a definition of contributing. Neumann stated on page 44 of the Bulletin states 7 aspects of integrity that define contributing. Doud stated that he thinks everyone agrees on historical integrity, but thinks the other criteria do not stop anything in an historic district. Doud stated that he feels the definition of contributing is expanding. Neumann

stated that the sum of all the elements of integrity is the definition of contributing. A structure older than 50 years is just one of several important criteria. Rentrop read the definition of a contributing structure as a structure or object that adds to the historic architectural quality, historic association or archeological value for which the value of the property is significant. Doud views the difference between contributing and non-contributing as the foundation of the HDC and feels the definition is expanding. Neumann stated the definition has always been there but perhaps it is a lack of education. Doud suggested the Bulletin should be sent to City Council and the Planning Commission for their edification as well. Doud requested that a definition with clearer guidelines be brought back to the May meeting. Neumann reminded Doud that Guidelines were created by the HDC already. Doud requested that those Guidelines be sent to all Commission members.

- **C22-019-010(H) Coal Dock-Notice to Proceed Resolution**

Rentrop stated that the Section 106 application is still evolving. The Army Corp of Engineers is the lead on this and will submit the SHPO application once they receive it from the HDC. Exhibits will also be submitted with the application including the archeological study done and pictures. Neumann stated the work to be done includes replacing wood decking with concrete decking, replacing framing members, horizontal beams and piles. The existing piles will be pulled out if possible, with new ones driven in their places, but if not possible existing will stay in place. The existing concrete head wall will be supplemented with a new steel sheet piling wall a few feet out, with the space between backfilled. In addition, the gas pumps will be moved a few feet to the west. The hardware store is to be removed and the area left open until they rebuild the hardware building to be used for office space, rest rooms and a waiting area. Neumann feels all proposed repairs are appropriate. Dombroski stated metal piles are proposed later on for lateral support. McGreevy noted that 8" caps will be used on the wood piles due to code requirements. It was decided to review the application in whole. Motion by Doud, second by Sehoan to adopt the Resolution drafted by Rentrop. Roll call vote: Ayes: Doud, Finkel, Sehoan. Nays: None. All in favor. Motion carries.

NEW BUSINESS

- **C22-032-017(H) Callewaert-Door and Awning Replacement**

Neumann stated he reluctantly approved the project due to the fact that the awning was not appropriate. However, the awning is existing and only the valance portion is proposed to be changed. The proposed door is appropriate. Motion by Doud, second by Sehoan to approve the application. All in favor. Motion carries.


- **Reconstruction**

Doud stated there is a structure outside of a historic district, that would the owner would like to demo. Doud is wondering if the HDC could approach the owner and propose reconstruction of the building. Rentrop believes you can. Neumann stated that Fort Holmes and Fort Michilimackinac

are both good examples of reconstruction. Reconstruction would encourage the owner to maintain the historic integrity. Neumann stated rehab is also a good option if the building is in good enough shape. Dombroski stated the structure is old but still a somewhat sound building. Article 18 of the Zoning Ordinance provides some protection to structures outside of an historic district. Doud thinks shoring up the Zoning Ordinance would be a good alternative to creating a new historic district. Michael Straus, Chair of Planning Commission, stated he is in discussion with the city attorney regarding this issue and will be a topic at today's Planning Commission meeting.

PUBLIC COMMENT

With no further business there was a Motion by Sehoan, second by Doud to adjourn the meeting. All in favor. Motion carries. Meeting was adjourned at 11:15 p.m.



Lee Finkel, Chairman



Katie Pereny, Secretary