

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION
HELD TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 10, 2020 AT 1:00 P.M. IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY
HALL, MACKINAC ISLAND, MICHIGAN**

Chairman Finkel called a regular meeting of the Mackinac Island Historic District to order at 1:01 p.m.

PRESENT: Andrew Doud, Lee Finkel, Lorna Straus, Alan Schoyan, Nancy Porter (all via Zoom)

ABSENT: None

STAFF: Zoning Administrator, Dennis Dombroski, Architect, Richard Neumann (via Zoom),
Attorney, Gary Rentrop (via Zoom)

Motion by Porter, seconded by Schoyan to approve as written, and place on file the minutes of the regular meeting Tuesday, October 13, 2020. All in favor. Motion carries.

Motion by Doud, seconded by Porter to approve as written and place on file the Agenda. All in favor. Motion carries.

CORRESPONDENCE

- **Gary Rentrop Statement July 10, 2020.**

Rentrop summarized his statement. \$18K was for Verizon work for the City. Rentrop gave an update on the Chippewa and Lilac Tree Hotel applications. The status is the same as last month. Motion by Porter, second by Doud to place the statement on file. All in favor. Motion carries.

COMMITTEE REPORTS

- None

STAFF REPORTS

- **MD20-021-064(H) Hellis-Window and Trim Replacement**

Dombroski stated this is a like for like replacement of a casement window and trim replacement around the 2nd floor bay window. Finkel asked Neumann if casement windows were historic and Neumann stated they are.

- **MD20-027-065(H) Benjamin-Siding and Trim Replacement**

Dombroski stated this is a like for like application for replacement of rotted siding and trim.

- **R120-076-067(H) Dorsey-Deck Repairs**

Dombroski stated this is an application for a deck repair. The applicant started the work without approval and was charged the penalty fee in addition to the permit fee.

- **Arches Data Management Platform – Richard Neumann**

Neumann stated this is an open source software that would require IT support. Neumann stated he does not know a lot about the program and would like to research it further. Neumann stated it could possibly be beneficial for the entire island. Possibly the State Park would be interested in sharing the program. Allen Burt asked that we send him the information and he would be happy to research it and get back to the Commission. Rentrop noted that our inventory should be updated and he would like to address open spaces. Motion by Finkel, second by Porter to send the information to Allen Burt for further research. All in favor. Motion carries.

Motion by Doud, second by Schoyan to accept the Staff Report. All in favor. Motion carries.

OLD BUSINESS

- **MD16-028-054(H)** **Richard Doud Material Amendment**

The applicant is proposing to use a material that is larger than the currently approved material. Porter asked the applicant if the new material would be less expensive. R. Doud stated he did not know the cost difference, he just preferred the look of the larger material. Neumann stated the manufacturer states the profile is historic, but Neumann has not seen the size used historically in Michigan. Neumann also checked with Sharon Ferraro in Kalamazoo, and she too has never seen it used historically in Michigan. Dombroski stated there are actually two parts to this amendment. The first part is the stair material. The applicant removed the green carpet from the stairs and discovered a Trex like material. The applicant would like to keep the existing material. Neumann stated he is good with the step material. Motion by Porter, second by Doud to approve the existing step material. All in favor. Motion carries. The second part of the amendment is for the wider Aeratis material for the porch decking. The currently approved size is 3" and the applicant would like to use a 6" size instead. Finkel stated he was fine with the 6" size. Doud stated he was OK with it since it really is not visible from the street. Porter stated she believed the larger size would have very little visual impact from the street and thinks it is appropriate for the homeowner to decide what he wants to use. Neumann warned of setting a precedent in approving the larger, non-historic size. The Commission agreed that in this case, since the decking is not very visible from the street that is it OK to approve the 6" size. Motion by Doud, second by Porter to approve the 6" Aeratis decking based on the fact that the visual impact from the street is minimal. All in favor. Motion carries.

NEW BUSINESS

- **HB20-050-066(H)** **Iroquois Hotel-Deck, Fence and Pergola Screening**

Barnwell stated that the screening on the pergola was destroyed in a storm. The deck is currently wood and they would like to use a synthetic material. The applicant would like to use a 3" tongue and groove Aeratis material that matches the existing wood 3" material. Neumann stated he is comfortable with both the screening and the Aeratis material for the deck. Motion by Porter, second by Doud to approve the application. All in favor. Motion carries.

Doud "stepped away" from the table.

- **C20-042-072(H)** **Doud's Market Walk-In Cooler**

Doud would like to pour a cement slab in the 4' x 10' cavity between Alford's and Doud's, underneath the existing fire escape. This will allow for the installation of an additional walk-in cooler and will allow the applicant to store more upstairs rather than the basement. Dombroski stated there are a couple legal issues and fire code issues that need to be resolved before the job could be done. Doud acknowledged the issues to be resolved. Motion by Porter, second by Finkel to approve the application. Roll call vote: Ayes: Finkel, Sehoyan, Porter. Nays: None. Abstain: Doud. Straus was not able to respond via Zoom due to technical issues. Majority in favor. Motion carries.

Doud "returned" to the table.

- **2021 Meeting Dates**

Motion by Porter, second by Doud to adopt the 2021 meeting dates. Roll call vote: Ayes: Doud, Finkel, Sehoan, Porter. Nays: None. Straus was unable to respond via Zoom due to technical issues. Majority in favor. Motion carries.

- **Guidelines for Tree Removal**

Dombroski stated this discussion was initiated by a partial lot clearing in the Annex. Dombroski asked Rentrop if trees were a historic resource and he stated that yes, they are something that should be reviewed. Dombroski stated that he personally thought that a homeowner should be able to remove a couple of trees especially if they are causing problems. Cutting a large number of trees changes the character of a property and the HDC needs to determine if they want to keep trees as something to review. There was a discussion on the topic and no action was taken. Barnwell asked about historically contributing landscape shown on the Annex survey map. Rentrop stated some are listed as historically contributing, and should be.

PUBLIC COMMENT

- None

With no further business there was a Motion by Doud, second by Finkel to adjourn the meeting. Meeting was adjourned at 2:16 pm.



Lee Finkel, Chairman



Katie Pereny, Secretary

1

2

3