VETERANS MEMORIAL PARK
PAVILION PROJECT – 2013
January 6, 2014

CHARRETTE SUMMARY

TABLE OF CONTENTS

The Boyne City Main Street Program and City of Boyne City selected Environment Architects of Traverse City to conduct a three-day, public design charrette for the Pavilion in Veterans Memorial Park. The goal of the charrette was to “gather public input and consider possibilities to create a year-round, multi-activity structure in Veterans Memorial Park to be used by residents and organizations and as a permanent winter farmers market.” The adaptation and reuse of the existing Veterans Memorial Park Pavilion was one of the possibilities explored.

The following summary reflects the final product of the three-day charrette conducted on site at the Boyne City, City Hall Building. The project consisted of four primary activities which are included as sections in this report as follows:

Section One
Base Data Collection (conducted November 22, 2013)

Section Two
Stakeholder Meetings (conducted December 12, 2013)

Section Three
Charrette Workshop (conducted December 13, 2013)

Section Four
Public Presentation Session (conducted December 17, 2013; Tuesday evening) and Final Concepts
VETERANS MEMORIAL PARK
PAVILION PROJECT – 2013
January 6, 2014

SECTION ONE
BASE DATA COLLECTION

The base data collection phase of the project included on-site field measurement and assessment of the existing pavilion structure.

This section includes a sample set of photos of the existing pavilion, existing construction documents for the Veterans Memorial Park Pavilion provided by City Staff. Included you will also find images from a 3-dimensional, digital model created by the design team and used for communication during the second phase of the project.
These photos are representative of those taken during the base data collection phase:
The following images were exported from the 3-dimensional digital model:
existing elevation

existing pavilion plan

Floor Plan

Charette 1345
Boyne City, Michigan
Planning the Pavilion

Scale: existing pavilion plan
1/4" = 1'-0"

Scale: existing elevation
1/4" = 1'-0"

50'-0"
16'-0"
65'-11.5"
8'-8"
2'-0"
87" 16"
2'-11"
87" 16"
5'-0"
3'-5"
29'-8"
11'-3"
4'-10"
8"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
2'-11"
2" 13'-10"
SECTION TWO
STAKEHOLDER MEETINGS

The Stakeholder Meetings phase of the project included onsite interviews with a variety of stakeholder groups ranging from 5 to 25 participants. The interview schedule was as follows:

- Farmers Market - 9:00-10:15am
- Downtown Business Community - 10:30-11:45am
- City Staff - 1:00-2:15pm
- Pavilion Users/Events - 2:30-3:45pm
- Neighbors - 4:00-5:15pm
- Public - 5:30-6:45pm

This section includes the questionnaire used to frame the public discussion as well as the summary of all the comments received. The actual sheets that all the participants’ comments were recorded on have been provided to the Main Street staff.
The following photos are from the Stakeholder Meetings:
VETERANS PARK
PAVILION PROJECT – 2013

STAKEHOLDER QUESTIONNAIRE

1. What activities do you currently participate in at the Veterans Memorial Park Pavilion?
   a. 
   b. 
   c. 

2. What activities would you like to see at the Park or Pavilion that do not currently take place there?
   a. 
   b. 
   c. 

3. Are there building or site elements that do not currently exist that would be required to facilitate these activities?
   a. 
   b. 
   c. 

4. What would you change about the existing Pavilion?
   a. 
   b. 
   c. 

5. Is there anything you would not change about the existing Pavilion?
   a. 
   b. 

6. Should a new facility or different site be considered to house these activities, including a winter farmers market?
VETERANS PARK
PAVILION PROJECT – 2013
12-13-13

The following is a summary of patterns identified through the stakeholder input process. Full responses are available from the Boyne City Main Street Program. The questions were used as our framework for discussion.

Stakeholder Summary

1. What activities do you currently participate in at the Veterans Memorial Park Pavilion?
   - Large community festivals and events. Multiday functions that attract upwards of thousands of visitors (over 1500). These included 4th of July, Mushroom Festival, Boyne Thunder.
   - Mid-sized community events and festivals that attract between 250 and up to 1500 participants included car shows, veterans memorial events, yacht events (regattas), cycling events, running events.
   - Reoccurring events particularly the farmer’s market attracting upwards of 500 visitors for a single day.
     - Summer vendors assume 65. 10’x10’ minimum in 5’ increments.
     - Winter vendors. Assume 35. 6’x5’ in 5’ increments with minimum 8’ walkways.
   - Small Community and private events that range up to 250 participants. These would include school outings, family reunions’, private parties, sailing groups, community picnics and meetings.
   - Individual users which would include unscheduled use of pavilion and park including play groups and picnickers.

2. What activities would you like to see at the Park or Pavilion that do not currently take place there?
   - Winter farmers market
   - Expanded winter use including warming hut, ice rink, winter festival/party space
   - Entertainment space, particularly music and concerts but also included out movie screenings
   - Expanded Yacht Club and Marina Activities
   - Flexible meeting space for approximately 30-100 users;
o Summer; accommodate larger groups with some weather protection
o Winter; heated and protected space

3. Are there building or site elements that do not currently exist that would be required to facilitate these activities?
   - Kitchen
     o Farmers Market suggested full commercial and demonstration/teaching configuration
     o All other groups suggesting warming kitchen with sink for cleaning
   - Storage
     o Farmers Market suggested expanded storage including refrigerated and dry storage for food as well as general storage.
     o All other groups suggested general storage.
   - Enhanced Wi-Fi.
   - Small group picnic areas and toilet access for when Pavilion is occupied by large events or reserved by mid-sized reserved users
   - Heated or protected space
   - Additional bathroom facilities; weatherized?
   - Service drive for unloading at building
   - Concession/dedicated vending area

4. What would you change about the existing Pavilion?
   - Improved and updated bathrooms including ADA accessibility
     o Open one set of bathrooms to exterior to maintain public accessibility when pavilion is reserved
   - Eliminate fireplace and provide relocated outdoor grilling provisions
   - Relocate pavilion to a different position on-site or re-orient existing pavilion
   - Eliminate fireplace but provide new alternative fireplace location (maximizing open space)
   - Improved wind protection
   - Bury Electrical Utilities
   - Remove fixed Benches
   - Improved parking and circulation
   - Improved Architectural aesthetic including higher ceiling, additional natural light and transparency
     o Mixed response related to flat roof or taller sloped roof
5. Is there anything you would not change about the existing Pavilion?
   - Open access/Public access
   - Visibility
   - Connection to Playground

6. Should a new facility or different site be considered to house these activities, including a winter farmers market?
   - Consideration should be given to existing relationships between Farmers Market, Veteran Memorial and fact that a pavilion at Veterans Park is required
   - Peninsula Park
   - Future considerations related to City Hall and DPW site
   - West of Playground
   - Turnaround west of little league field – underutilized parcel.

General Considerations
- Flexible space
  - Sliding/folding doors allowing space to be closed up.
  - Indoor/outdoor spaces
- Consider overall site master plan and connections to adjacent facilities
- Consider portable kitchen/food truck or neighboring facilities such as planned community center to address kitchen needs.
- Low maintenance and easy to maintain
- Many people suggested minimal heating of space to 50-60 degrees would be acceptable for winter use.
- Historical references
- Pavilion and site need to respond to environmental including:
  - Solar orientation
  - Wind
  - Views to water
- Parking concerns
  - Physically improve facilities
  - Enhanced way finding/use of banners
- Environmental Concerns
  - “green” elements, energy efficiency, natural light, storm water considerations (permeable surfaces)
- Architectural References
  - Traditional/Historic both downtown brick as well as mill waterfront
  - Rustic/Northern Michigan
  - Nautical
SECTION THREE
CHARRETTE WORKSHOP

The Charrette Workshop phase of the project was a single day working session held in the City Commission Chambers. The design team reviewed comments from the stakeholder meetings conducted the previous day and identified patterns with which to develop three design concepts. This session was open to the public and we received a total of 15-20 visitors throughout the course of the day. As the concept sketches developed, we presented them to visitors to receive additional valuable input that informed the designs.

In this section we have included the preliminary sketches of each concept that was developed during the workshop.
The Public Presentation was a single evening event where the final design concepts were presented to the public at the Community Room of the Boyne District Library. The event was attended by at least 30 community members who provided valuable feedback on each of the design concepts. Locally made Hors d'oeuvres were provided by the Farmer’s Market Committee.

*This section includes summary sheets for each of the three design concepts including estimates of probable cost. The attached concept sheets were used during the Public Presentation. A 3-dimensional, digital site model was also used to illustrate the design concepts, provide visual feedback, and help answer questions during the Public Presentation.*

*All concepts were well received and the next step will be to select a preferred concept to further develop; ultimately for bidding and construction.*
The following photos are from the Public Presentation Session:
CONCEPT SUMMARY - CONCEPT ONE

Concept One was envisioned as the least intrusive of the three concepts. The intent was to utilize as much of the existing structure as possible.

Concept One - Key Points:

a. Maintain existing roof, structure and columns
b. New brick exterior - inspired by the historic character of new developments and Downtown
c. Sliding doors to create a three-season space - moderate weatherproofing for winter use
d. Renovate bathrooms - create additional entry points
e. Additions include: family picnic spaces and a pergola
f. Eliminate the existing fireplaces
**Concept One - Estimate of Probable Cost:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Site Work</td>
<td>$25,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demolition</td>
<td>$20,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concrete</td>
<td>$10,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masonry</td>
<td>$36,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steel (pergola)</td>
<td>$20,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doors/Windows</td>
<td>$75,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roofing</td>
<td>$10,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misc. Carpentry</td>
<td>$25,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interior Finishes</td>
<td>$12,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electrical</td>
<td>$20,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanical</td>
<td>$10,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plumbing</td>
<td>$50,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subtotal</strong></td>
<td><strong>$313,000.00</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contractor (OHP)</td>
<td>$46,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional Fees</td>
<td>$30,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contingency</td>
<td>$20,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Project Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>$409,000.00</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Veteran's Memorial Park Pavilion
Concept 1 - Lowest Impact
Veteran's Memorial Park Pavilion

Concept 1 - Lowest Impact

Key Points:

a. Maintain existing roof, structure, and columns
b. New brick exterior to pick up historical context of new developments and downtown
c. Sliding doors to create three-season space - moderate weatherproofing for winter use
d. Renovate bathrooms - create additional exit points
e. Additions include: single family picnic space and pergola
f. Eliminate existing fireplaces

---

CONCEPT 1

key points:

a. maintain existing roof, structure and columns
b. new brick exterior- to pick up historical context of new developments and downtown
c. sliding doors to create three season space - moderate weatherproofing for winter use
d. renovate bathrooms- create additional entry points
e. additions include: single family picnic space and pergola
f. eliminate existing fireplaces
CONCEPT SUMMARY - CONCEPT TWO

Concept Two was envisioned as a compromise solution. It would be a significant renovation and change to the existing pavilion while maintaining the pavilion’s existing location.

Concept Two - Key Points:
- Maintain existing structure and columns
- New roof structure
- New brick exterior - inspired by the historic character of new developments and Downtown
- Full-glass garage doors to create a three-season space - moderate weatherproofing for winter use
- Renovate bathrooms - create additional entry points
- Additions include: family picnic spaces, a pergola, and additional pavilion area
- Eliminate the existing fireplaces
Concept Two - Estimate of Probable Cost:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Cost</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Site Work</td>
<td>$60,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Demolition</td>
<td>$20,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Concrete</td>
<td>$35,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masonry</td>
<td>$50,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steel (pergola)</td>
<td>$20,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doors/Windows</td>
<td>$75,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roofing</td>
<td>$35,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misc. Carpentry</td>
<td>$75,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interior Finishes</td>
<td>$12,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electrical</td>
<td>$40,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanical</td>
<td>$15,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plumbing</td>
<td>$60,000.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Subtotal .................. $497,000.00

Contractor (OHP) ........... $75,000.00
Professional Fees ........ $45,000.00
Contingency ............... $30,000.00

Project Total ............ $647,000.00
Veteran's Memorial Park Pavilion
Concept 2 - New Roof Form + Addition
**Veteran's Memorial Park Pavilion**

**Concept 2 - New Roof Form + Addition**

- Key points:
  a. Maintain existing structure and columns
  b. New roof structure
  c. New brick exterior to pick up historical context of new developments and downtown
  d. Full glass garage doors to create three season space - moderate weatherproofing for winter use
  e. Renovate bathrooms - create additional entry points
  f. Additions include: single family picnic space, pergola plus additional pavilion area
  g. Eliminate existing fireplaces

**Estimate of Probable Cost**

CONCEPT 2 = $650,000.00 - $800,000.00
CONCEPT SUMMARY-
CONCEPT THREE

Concept Three was envisioned as the “out of the box” solution. It would demolish the existing pavilion and locate a new structure within Veterans Memorial Park closer to the water. It would require overall changes to the master site plan of the Veteran’s Memorial Park area but could work nicely with future efforts at the adjacent city facilities parcel. Consequently this would be the most expensive option.

Concept Three - Key Points:
a. Utilize Concept Two floor plan and elevations
b. Reclaim existing materials where possible from existing structure
c. Separate State Street from North Street giving Marina individual identity
d. Moves Pavilion closer to water
e. Connect North Street to the City Hall parking lot with a drive around the "point"
f. Creates expanded green space where existing structure is removed
Concept Two - Estimate of Probable Cost:
Site Work ....................... Specifically excluded; to be determined with final overall master plan and road re-routing

The balance of this estimate is based on the following square footage and corresponding costs:
Main Pavilion:
3,750 square feet @ $150/s.f ............... $562,000.00

Kitchen/Core:
1,950 square feet @ $200/s.f ............... $390,000.00

Picnic Pavilions:
900 square feet @ $75/s.f ............... $68,000.00

Subtotal ................................. $1,020,000.00

Contractor (OHP) ............ $150,000.00
Professional Fees ........... $100,000.00
Contingency ...................... $40,000.00

Project Total .................. $1,310,000.00
Veteran's Memorial Park Pavilion
Concept 3 - Relocated Pavilion
Veteran's Memorial Park Pavilion

Concept 3 - Relocated Pavilion

Key Points:

a. Utilize Concept 2 floor plan and elevations
b. Reclaim existing materials where possible from existing structure
c. Separate State Street from North Street creating individual identity
d. Move Pavilion closer to water
e. Connect North Street to City Hall parking lot with developed drive around the "point"

Estimate of Probable Cost

Concept 3: $1,000,000.00 - $1,250,000.00