

**Cheboygan County Board of Commissioners
Committee of the Whole Meeting
August 27, 2019**

The Committee of the Whole meeting of the Cheboygan County Board of Commissioners was called to order in the Commissioners Room by Chairperson John Wallace at 9:31 a.m.

Roll called and a quorum present.

PRESENT: Commissioners Mary Ellen Tryban, Richard Sangster, Michael Newman, Cal Gouine, Roberta Matelski, John Wallace and Steve Warfield

ABSENT: None

Commissioner Wallace gave the invocation and led the Pledge of Allegiance.

Motion by Commissioner Tryban, seconded by Commissioner Matelski, to approve the agenda moving Item #6 Scheduled Visitors/Department Reports up to Item #5 and move Item #5 Citizen Comments down to Item #6. Motion carried with 7 yes, 0 no and 0 absent.

SCHEDULED VISITORS/DEPARTMENT REPORTS

89th District Court Judge Maria Barton presented the 2018 Annual Report. She introduced Mariah Winters a new employee who began employment in December 2018 replacing Deborah Keller who retired after almost 29 years. Ms. Winters is responsible for court collections and maintaining the District Court jurors. She is currently going through training to be a magistrate. In 2018, the 89th District Court total expenditures were \$15,336.78 less than budgeted. District Court has come in under budget every year from 2009 through 2018 for a total savings of \$258,470.92 to the county. One of the ways the court is saving money is through the use of a Polycom system, which was installed in 2013. The District Court utilizes this equipment whenever possible in order to make the most efficient use of time for the court, staff, police agencies, Department of Corrections and assigned judges. In 2018, the District Court, through the use of the Polycom, helped the county save an estimated \$6,839.50 in prisoner transportation, and visiting judge costs saving approximately \$29,133.29 for the years 2013 through 2018. Another area that the court addresses finances is court costs. To date the court has collected approximately \$131,251.46 on cases where garnishments were sent to the individual came in and paid prior to the garnishment being processed by the Department of Treasury. An additional collection of \$7,271.70 has been collected via garnishments that were issued and processed by the Department of Treasury. Sobriety Court is another area that the court strives to save money. The budget was \$9,200 and YTD Activity came in under budget only spending \$4,787.78. The last area where District Court saves money is thru the work crew with the Sheriff Department. There were 80 inmates that were sent on the work crew from District Court. This was a big savings to the county. Looking at the 2018 District Court case load, it showed that Civil Infractions were up by 132, where Traffic Misdemeanor cases filed were down by 34. The area of concern was General Civil cases, which were up considerably by 78, along with Small Claims at 165, which doubled and Landlord Tenant cases were down by 20. In the last year, District Court has also been very efficient with their case flow management. District Court is required to keep track of its statistics for the State of Michigan to show how efficient they are being. In 2018, the 89th District Court's clearance rate was 98% with 5,209 new or reopened cases and 5,106 disposed of cases. Also District Court is meeting all of the guidelines set in place by the Michigan Supreme Court except one, which is the preliminary

examination of each case scheduled within 14 days of the offense occurring. She explained that District Court has never met this because she felt it was an unreasonable time guideline. District Court runs the Sobriety Court without any additional funding from the county, state or federal grants, and all programming is done in-house, with the help of Harbor Hall. She stated that the mission of the District Court is to help substance abusers achieve sobriety by providing a structural framework, helping them to be successful and facilitate change in addictive behaviors. She urged all of the Board of Commissioners to attend at least one of the sobriety sessions held on Monday mornings to see what it's all about. Commissioner Newman commented that 89th District Court was not held to sentencing guidelines similar to the felony cases and he asked how the Judge felt about that. Judge Barton commented that she did not know how she felt about this. If there were sentencing guidelines, she knew what it would mean to the Board. An additional probation officer would have to be hired for the additional paper work required. The rationale behind the sentencing guidelines in felony cases is because you want to make sure that people were treated fairly. If District Court was ordered to have sentencing guidelines for misdemeanors, it was going to have to come through the state and the legislature, which was probably going to be a several years down the road.

MSU-E District Director Adam Koivisto thanked the Board for letting them present the MSU-E 2018-2019 Annual Report. He stated that all most all of the entire team was here except for one team member, which was Lindsey Gardner who was down in Lansing for training today. If there were any questions or comments regarding her report, they could contact her directly on the Government & Public Policy section.

MSU-E 4-H Program Coordinator Leigh Ann Theunick wanted to remind everyone that the 4-H's mission was to empower us to reach our full potential while working and learning in partnership with caring adults. The 4-H programs are delivered through many different fashions. First of all, there are the year-round clubs in Cheboygan County. This past year there were five (5) clubs with nine (9) adult club leaders and 33 youth members participating in those clubs. There were three (3) after school clubs with three (3) adult club leaders and 31 youth members participating. Overnight events were offered throughout the year in camps. This past year there were six (6) events or camps with 52 adults and 65 youths participating. In particular it takes three (3) adults for every rider from the Proud Equestrian Program Camp Rein or Shine, which is a therapeutic horseback riding camp for youths with disabilities. Another piece that she does is school enrichment activities. She mainly works with partnership with the schools. One thing that 4-H has was research evidence based curriculum. It was great to come into schools and do hands on activities that really help youths and teachers. This past year, she did three (3) different school enrichment activities. The first one she assisted a math teacher with a rocket project that taught students about angles, velocity and data collection, but also about teamwork, problem-solving and communication. She also facilitated a field trip with one of the schools and went to Knaebe's Farm where the youths learned about growing an apple orchard, tasted the different variety of apples and how the stomach works. This spring, Wolverine students in the 8th grade science class explored the 4-H Beginning of Life (embryology) curriculum. The class observed the life cycle of a chicken by incubating chicken eggs, watching the embryo develop and finally, celebrating the successful hatching of chicks. The science teacher related the chick development and growth to the human development and growth process. Finally the other thing that she does in 4-H was short term special events with typically an educational focus to them. The goal is to bring in quality education and secondly to expose people to 4-H and, hopefully, draw them into part of their year around clubs. This past year, she did seven (7) of those, which included 64 adults and 155 youths. Each of the Board of Commissioners was given supplies for a science experiment to complete.

MSU-E District Director Adam Koivisto commented that in the interest of time, he was not going to read the letter that Lindsey Gardner wrote. She does the Government & Public Policy and there was a section in the report on that. If anyone has any questions, get with him afterwards.

Earlier Childhood Program Instructor Danielle Melching presented information on various early childhood development programs for parents and early childhood providers. Her focus was mainly on a series of workshops because it did bring in more active programming for folks in Cheboygan County. The topics of education that she supplies includes discipline, social and emotional health, mindfulness, helping parents and childhood providers understand toddlers in their world and helping Moms overcome challenging behaviors such as biting and tantrums. Also there were topics on resilience and helping children bounce back from making mistakes, and academic learning topics such a math, literacy and science. All of these programs offer hands on learning experience that give adults a chance to learn and practice new skills that they can take back to work with their children or their homes to help children be successful in school and life and impact their development and multiply in different ways. Through these programs, adults gain knowledge and skills that they can actively use with youths and children. It was really important that we prepare children for their future and set them up for success. This was the most important job that we have and to always keep this as our focus. A child care provider once said, "Every child has his or her way of dealing with and understanding of the world. With small steps and repeating, you can mold a child to be a person of society!" Her goal for 2020 was to build more impactful and stronger relationships with the Department of Health and Human Services as well as the Family Court systems. Currently, she was working on building a curriculum that helped the needs of the Family Court system and families in Cheboygan County to help their children be successful in school because if they were successful in school, they can also be successful in other aspects of their lives such as relationships and in their future careers.

Health and Nutritional Instructor Cheyenne Farr commented that she works with low income adults, families and local schools to introduce healthy eating habits to increase fruits and vegetable consumptions. Since she started in February, she has worked with Alcona Health Center to refer patients to the Cooking Matters class. This class was focused on preparing meals at home and really stretching their food dollars whether that comes from SNAP and BRIDGE cards or from local commodities like the food pantry. After each class, the participants get to take home free groceries for the meals that were provided and get to use those skills that they learned in class to prepare a meal at home for their families. This year we also provided healthy food tastings at Wolverine Elementary. Time was spent with the youths on knowledge of nutrition labels, food groups, and food safety, as well as tasting new foods. This year, in partnership with Cheboygan Council on Aging, Cheboygan County and United Way, we distributed \$14,240 in coupons to 356 eligible seniors through the statewide program, Senior Market Fresh. This program allowed seniors to access fresh, local produce in the effort to increase fruit and vegetable consumption, and to support local farmers in the area. In 2019, MSU-E Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program Education (SNAP-Ed) programs reached 457 adults and youths in Cheboygan County through a one-time presentation and six (6) week series. In the upcoming year, she plans to work with over 400 youths through Cheboygan's East Elementary School and NEMCSA Head Start as well as continued efforts to provide classes to adults and seniors.

MSU-E Office Manager Mary McTevia handed out information on insects and passed around a curio box filled with a few specimens. Along with providing support to staff members as well as the director, she utilizes over 20 years of experience in assisting clients by phone and in person. MSU-E receives over 2,000 phone calls a year. Many phone calls that were received were

regarding problems with plants, gardens, lawns and flowers. Also many people come into the office to get a soil test because they were either a consumer grower or a commercial grower. MSU-E identifies many insects during the year. It seems to be the thing that she does most. Many of the insects that they see are not all in the curio box hat was being passed around. This year MSU-E received many phone calls on bees, bronze birch borer, carpenter ants, pine sawyer beetles and one eye click beetles and there were too many insects to mention. She has identified snakes which turned up in a shoe box on her desk. Luckily this one was dead, but she has had live ones. The number one request was spiders with the wolf spider being the number one spider that was received. She also prepares finance documents from MSU-E as well as county documents.

CITIZENS COMMENTS

Dale Giddings citizen of Mentor Township had a few questions about this Enbridge Resolution. First what Cheboygan County citizens group asked for this resolution? It has Enbridge's fingerprints all over it and lacks that home baked smell. Who have you consulted in order to form your decision on this issue? The resolution is all Enbridge talking folks. It certainly must have occurred to the Board that there were other ways to look at this. Especially since Enbridge has a huge financial incentive to exaggerate. There were people here in Cheboygan County that had studied this issue up one side and down the other. Wouldn't it be prudent to at least table this until the Board has had a chance to consult with these experts who may have a different takes on this. Three minutes of comments is not enough time to present the kind of thorough analysis the Board needs in order to make an informed decision. If you pass this resolution, can you guarantee to the people of Cheboygan County that Enbridge will in fact complete this tunnel? Of course, the Board cannot because Enbridge retains the option of abandoning the project at any time. If you want to pass a resolution, shouldn't it at least have a clause that the Board would support a tunnel if and only if there was a legal document binding Enbridge to finish the tunnel. If the Board passes this resolution can the Board guarantee to Cheboygan County that there will be no oil discharge in the straits during the construction process, which will last for years. The Board of Commissioners has nothing to gain.

Carl Muscott citizen of Tuscarora Township commented that the first thing that the Board should take under consideration was from having a full room like this is if the Board was doing the job right, no one would be here. When there was a full room of people, the Board was doing something wrong. There has been a lot of discussion on how much a contributor Enbridge has been to the counties coffers. The top five (5) tax payers with Enbridge being number one (1). Enbridge pays approximately 1 1/2% of the property taxes. It has to be weighed against the fact that \$97 million in tourism income came into Cheboygan County in 2017. The Board was gambling \$660,000 in property taxes versus \$97 million in tourism income. There were all these false statements from Enbridge's bullet points from their propaganda. He pointed out from the resolution that there were no local producers of energy, no regional airport and no refinery. Enbridge employs only 96 full and temporary employees in the entire state. It is all a win win for Enbridge. Their idea was to move 540,000 of barrels or gallons of oil through Michigan every day that principally goes to Saudi refineries or even further East. Enbridge could use Line 3B, which has all been rebuilt.

Leonard Page citizen of Grant Township gave a little history stating that Cheboygan was the first county in the State of Michigan in 2016 to pass a resolution seeking the decommissioning of Line 5. In 2016, a Cheboygan group got similar resolutions from at least 60 or 70 counties, cities, townships, and tribal groups in Northern Michigan with some being from downstate, which were all forwarded to Governor Snyder and Schutte and they never even got an

acknowledgment. Now Enbridge has five (5) or six (6) county resolutions. If the Board was governed by Robert Rules of Order and wanted to rescind or amend a previous passed resolution, please check with your county attorney. Robert Rules of Order requires a 2/3 vote to rescind or amend a resolution. He commented that a 2.5 million worse case spill, which Michigan Tech studies have said could happen, would be devastation beyond our comprehension. A 2016 Schwab study from the University of Michigan stated there could be oil on 740 miles of shoreline. The formula for risk: probability time's consequences.

Leo Forster citizen of Inverness Township commented why Enbridge cannot be trusted. Enbridge failed to notify the state about a gap succeeding the agreed upon 75 foot span right up until 2003. This line was installed in 1953. When reported, one span exceeded 286 feet and another one was 240 feet. A Line 5 oil spill of 220,600 gallons at Crystal Falls in 1999 went unreported by Enbridge. In fact, no government entity was ever notified. Line 5 has had at least 15 spills. Enbridge never reported missing pipeline coatings around some of the 150 support structures with a request to put in 50 more support structures. The pipeline's safety advisory board's analysis was thrown out because the head engineer was found to be doing a Line 5 study for both Michigan and Enbridge. An alternative to that study was to investigate the possibility of using other existing lines carrying Line 5's load even though Enbridge doubled the size of the Line 6B after it cracked and created the greatest inland oil spill in American history on the tributary to the Kalamazoo River. Enbridge changed the number of Line 6B to Line 78. Why? Maybe it was so people won't remember Line 6B. This was not advertised because it would confuse people. He questioned why Enbridge continues to insist that their propane from the Rapid River station was necessary, when it has been proven that it can be provided by other propane sellers. In 2016, Enbridge stated that Line 5 was responsible for heating 85% the homes and later it was reduced to 65%. Now it has been proven that Enbridge cannot provide more than 47%.

Rosanne Rynerson citizen of Benton Township commented on several relatives that have gotten sick or passed away from working or living around oil refineries. She stated that she was an environmental scientist and worked with recycling at the fairgrounds. During recycling they use a lot of safety precautions because of the hazardous wastes. She hoped that the Board would shut down Line 5.

Dave Rynerson citizen of Benton Township and registered voter commented that there was not one of us here that wouldn't mind paying if we have to pay more for propane for gas, then to pay with the land or the water. If the land and the water were ruined, what does the county have? He hoped that the Board of Commissioner would listen to the comments made here today.

Cindy Kress citizen of Mentor Township commented that this summer she has been working at Shepler's Mackinaw Island Ferry working specifically on Mackinac Island. Every day she gets to ride the ferry from Mackinaw City over to the island and back where she gets to see the beautiful water and experience literally the thousands of people that cross it. She also sees how many people work at Shepler's, which is a big operation. An invitation was given to the Board to come over to the island, to see how many people work there and at the shops. When she thinks about the oil pipeline, she thinks about what would be lost if the 66 year old pipeline bursts. Enbridge is doing the drilling now to try and convince people that they really want to do the tunnel.

Sarah Jo Schuman commented that her family could be traced back for the past 10,000 years. She wanted to say that this was the time for the Board to be a good ancestor. The community has been pretty loud today and they were scared. If they were scared, what about your

grandchildren? Do you want your grandchildren to hate you and think that you did not think about their future? The Board was someone's grandchildren once and they thought about you and that was why you were here.

Larry Denemy commented that he was also Anishinaabe and wanted to remind everyone here they speak in Anishinaabe. The Anishinaabe word for river was ziibi. Mississippi was the great river. Kentucky is the land of the hills. Cheboygan means the land of the big pipe. This was very ceremonial ground. As Anishinaabe people, there was no removing our spirituality. He wanted to remind them that Andrew J. Blackbird's book was in the Library of Congress and the Andrew J. Blackbird's museum was located in Harbor Springs. This was a story on how smallpox was delivered to this area and how 80% of the population was decimated in weeks. The bodies were laying everywhere and were literally buried where they lay. So the entire Northern Michigan was a burial ground. He commented that he has heard some consequences for disrupting burials grounds and hoped that they would be honored.

Vincent Lumetta citizen of Beaugrand Township commented that they were at quite a disadvantage. The way that this was set up, Enbridge has access to the elected officials on many fronts. For example, Enbridge was a huge sponsor of the Michigan Township Association. So many of the elected officials that may go to those meetings, Enbridge was right there pushing their ideology on them. Pumping gas through the pipeline while building the tunnel. He would hope that the Board would pause and get more information on this.

Anabel Dwyer citizen of Mackinaw Township commented that she lived right on the straits. It was Cheboygan County and she wanted the Board to realize that the citizens have all been working for many years to try to make this place as beautiful as possible. Not to destroy it. She asked the Board to please propose any consideration of this very flawed resolution until the Board has open discussion as their Mission Statement states. There were comments on the resolution, which was from Dickenson County. This resolution has really not been looked at, which was being considered today. There had been comments on all of the whereases and conclusions of the resolution from Dickenson County. Obviously, there was much more discussion that needs to happen. Do not make a decision on this today.

Susan Page citizens of Grant Township commented when the pipeline was first built, Enbridge bragged that the technology was so great that that pipeline would last 50 years. It was now 66 years old. Enbridge should not be trusted because they lied about the gaps and the coatings. If you want to go on their Facebook page and say something negative or ask them a tough question, it is deleted. Enbridge does not want to talk about the reality. If you don't care about the loss of the birds and the fish, think about the loss of property values. The loss of property value not just for every lake front and river front properties if there is a spill between Burt and Mullett Lakes. The property values go down and so does the taxes. The county gets paid by taxes. Three million people do get their drinking water from the Great Lakes. The cost of a cleanup will never get paid for by Enbridge. The amount of insurance that they carry won't even touch a spill and no spill could be cleaned up 100%. There has already been one million gallons of oil spilled in various places such as wetlands and along Highway 2 in the Upper Peninsula. The Board represents the citizens of Cheboygan County regarding their health, safety and property values. Make Cheboygan County famous for environmental common sense and respect for these waters that define the county.

Dale Rieger citizen of Benton Township thanked the Board for their citizenship. Serving on a Board is not necessarily a great pleasure being proven by this meeting today. If you go from the extreme end of Benton Township and head to Mackinaw City, you will see sign after sign after

sign of citizens begging to not let Enbridge go any further. There was a time when the Board could have pled ignorance, but unlike the people in Grand Haven and Rockford who now have poisoned water because people did not take care of their responsibilities. If a plume of oil makes it way down to Indian River into Mullett Lake and if his wife and him stood on the end of the beach at the straits and looked toward the bridge and they see that a plume of oil was heading towards them, he would say, "How could this happen?" The Board of Commissioners would say, "What did I let happen?"

Rob Ross citizen of Benton Township and a place on Bois Blanc Island commented on what was wrong with us. It has been talked about that Enbridge was being under insured. If he had a car accident, the car could be replaced once it's wrecked, but there is no replacing the lakes. He had two grandsons who come for visits and he would like them to continue to come here. What would it be like to have this terrible oil spill? It would be terrible just like Enbridge's track record. He stated that he did not know in good conscious just step back and see what is happening. Enbridge spreads a few pennies to all of the government and communities, which they call good will. This was not good will, but insuring that their ability to have a corporate policy that walks over everybody that lives here is unimpeded. Please do not be a part of that.

Karen Martin citizen of City of Cheboygan commented that just about everything that she planned to say has been said here. She asked for a show of hands from the Board and the audience of how many lived here because of the lakes, rivers and the forests. The Board of Commissioners sitting here have the power and the responsibility to be good stewards and to be good guardians of what citizens have in their front yards and in their back yards, which were the lakes, rivers and streams. Two of her great grandchildren were living here, which were the seventh generation Martins. Hopefully, the Board will not put Enbridge first, but to put the environment and Cheboygan County first.

Sherry Nelson citizen of Mullett Lake questioned why the Board was even raising this resolution in support of the tunnel. If the tunnel was built today, if it was already in place, it would not be a solution for the other hundreds of miles that compromises the shore lines. It is unconscionable in her estimation to consider this tunnel. This was a diversionary tactic completely by Enbridge. Also Enbridge has agreed and the Coast Guard has reinforced an oil spill could not be contained. There is no way it could be contained given the currents, the wave patterns and the wind in the straits area. It would be a disaster.

Joanne Welihan, Co-Executive Director of Keep Michigan Beautiful commented that this was a state wide organization that rewards people around state for keep Michigan beautiful either by planting, cleaning or whatever it takes to keep the state as beautiful as we are. One of the winners was going to be Karen Martin who spent hours cleaning up forests off of Alpena Road. The organization had others in town that also has done work. The City of Cheboygan has been knocking themselves out trying to make this a place for people to come and enjoy. The Bring it Cheboygan committee worked tirelessly to make downtown look much better than ever it ever has. Yet, the Board was going to risk having an oil spill. Maybe it won't happen, but if it did, it was all for naught. Who will come here? Who will want to live here with oil on the shores? She commented that her husband and her live here on Lake Huron and they wouldn't live anywhere else but if an oil spill happened, what would they do. She asked the Board to please not put this resolution through.

Christy Stempky citizen of Mullett Township commented that she was born and raised here only leaving to attend college for four (4) years at Michigan State. Coming home every chance that she could get because of the water the natural assets and the beauty that we have here that is

completely priceless. To put the value on one company to own that is vulnerable. We sit in the most vulnerable state arguably in Michigan because of the watershed, the amount of water, and currents, and how it is all completely connected to everything. It has been said today in many different ways. Do your research and make sure that we are making the most conscience decision for everybody in the Cheboygan County.

JoAnne Hite citizen of the City of Cheboygan questioned what the reasons were for supporting this resolution.

Deb Hansen citizen of Munro Township commented like many people she has been involved in this issue for about six (6) years. She stated that she was very naïve and she thought that surely once we all knew what the risks were of this pipeline that it would be long done. This was a moral failure. This was not only a moral failure about the Straits of Mackinaw because we have demonstrated our contempt for one of the sources of life, which is water. Michigan was number one for PFAS contamination. Michigan imports one of the most hazardous wastes out there and processes it by dumping it in the sewer system of Detroit where it has been tested positive for arsenic. Michigan was the only state in the union that does not require any testing of septic tanks since their installation. There were rivers around the state that had E.coli bacteria. We are all responsible for protecting our environment. A climate collapse presentation was given at the City Council Meeting, which showed what climate collapse, looked like in Michigan along with what counties were doing as a solution. What was not mentioned was what it was like to live next to refinery? She has friends who live in what is called the Marathon Refinery where the air pollution is 45 times the state average. A moral responsibility challenge is to get off of fossil fuels. The United Nations is saying that we may have up until 2030, which is less than twelve years to reduce greenhouse gas emissions by almost half. This is bigger for her than Line 5. It is an inconvenience truth that was also not being dealt with. Let's be part of the solution.

Matthew Borke a Michigan resident commented that he wanted to put out as many facts as he could. In advertising, it takes seven times for something to enter your brain. These large companies know this and use this all the time. Once every hour or once every half hour a commercial is heard on the radio that continues to talk about Enbridge's turning their safe pipeline safer. And while he stood there speaking, you may hear Enbridge back in your head and the continuous things that you keep on reading. He commented on what was going through the pipeline, which were drugs. Fentanyl comes from cruel oil, it is radioactive and there were billions of things that could be made from it. This was a financial institution that relied on money. How to you define a drug problem? Dependency. Supporting Enbridge was 99 more years of continuance drugs funneled into the system. All permits were done by the waters resource department within the DEQ, which was now referred to as EGLE. This office does not communication with our mediation or redevelopment teams. These are the state institutions that know about the contaminations issues. The water department only communicates with a third party to get the factual information. The party was always paid for by the pipeline company whether it was stated in the permit process. If the Board continues to support this, the Board also continues to make citizens sick.

Yacine Rabhi a Michigan resident commented that in the Board's opening statement it was said that the Board wants to make the best decision for all. This line was going under the straits which involves a lot of water and was a huge problem in the global crisis regarding fossil fuel. He was not saying stop the dependency on propane or cut off the Upper Peninsula, but getting it out of the straits was very important. There could be a huge spill as everyone has already talked about that could affect everything from our health, the environment and the tourist dollars.

Everyone in Michigan likes to come up north and view the water and interact with nature. He begged the Board to shut this pipeline down.

ADMINISTRATOR'S REPORT

Administrator Jeff Lawson reported on the Marina Improvement Project. The engineer has submitted plans and specifications for the Marina project to EGLE and the Army Corp of Engineers. The application is currently under review. Once the permit type is determined by the State, the permit approval timeline will be identified and the project bidding can be scheduled.

Administrator Jeff Lawson reported on the Phone System Replacement. The County received 12 RFP Packets from vendors for phone system replacement. Staff will be reviewing the proposals with the consultant to provide recommendations to the Board for contract award.

Administrator Jeff Lawson reported on the Vehicle Fleet Management Service. RFP's for vehicle fleet management services have been posted. RFP's are due by 2:00 P.M. today. RFP's will be reviewed by staff and a cost analysis performed to determine if the County will award a contract.

Administrator Jeff Lawson reported on the Sand Road Senior Center. Staff has received quotes to complete replacement of heating and cooling units at the center as well as sealcoating all parking and drive area. The projects are scheduled to be complete by the fall.

Administrator Jeff Lawson reported on the Senior Millage Appropriations. Senior Millage Appropriations request for funding are currently being submitted by requesting agencies. Staff will be reviewing requests and a Millage Appropriation Committee meeting will be scheduled for committee recommendation for funding to the Board.

OLD BUSINESS – None

NEW BUSINESS

Administrator Jeff Lawson presented the SRR – MDOT Contract 2017-0032-P14 FY 2019 Section 5311 Capital Grant. This contract was to purchase one (1) van for Straits Regional Ride.

Motion by Commissioner Sangster, seconded by Commissioner Gouine to approve the contract and authorize the Chair to sign with any necessary budget adjustments. A roll call vote was taken. Motion carried with 7 yes, 0 no and 0 absent.

Administrator Jeff Lawson presented the SRR – MDOT Contract 2017-0032-P15 FY 2019 100% State – Replacement Bus. This contract was for the replacement of one (1) revenue vehicle up to 30 foot. The vehicle being replaced has reached its useful life in mileage and years of service. Contract awards SRR one additional revenue vehicle bus.

Motion by Commissioner Newman, seconded by Commissioner Tryban to approve the contract and authorize the Chair to sign with any necessary budget adjustments. A roll call vote was taken. Motion carried with 7 yes, 0 no and 0 absent.

Finance Director James Manko presented the Grant Application for 2020 Secondary Road Patrol and Traffic Accident Prevention Program. This grant offsets the cost of wage and fringe benefits related to one road patrol deputy. This grant is applied for each fiscal year and is included in the General Fund budget. The amount received for the period from October 1, 2018 through September 30, 2019 was \$42,225 or 49/21% of the total cost. The amount we are allowed to request for the upcoming grant period is \$47,855 or 53.72% of the total cost. The allowable allocation is determined by the State of Michigan Office of Highway Safety Planning. The grant application must be received by the Office of Highway Safety Planning by September 1, 2019.

Motion by Commissioner Warfield, seconded by Commissioner Gouine, to submit the grant application for the fiscal year 2020 Secondary Road Patrol and Traffic Accident Prevention program and authorize the chairperson to sign the grant agreement and any forthcoming required documentation after review by the Finance Director and Civil Counsel, if applicable. A roll call vote was taken. Motion carried with 7 yes, 0 no and 0 absent.

Administrator Jeff Lawson presented Cheboygan County Resolution 19-13 – in Support of Line 5 Tunnel.

Motion by Commissioner Warfield, seconded by Commissioner Sangster, to adopt the following resolution and authorize the Chair to sign.

Resolution 19-13
CHEBOYGAN COUNTY RESOLUTION IN SUPPORT OF LINE 5 TUNNEL

WHEREAS, Enbridge’s Line 5 has been operating safely and reliably in Straits of Mackinac for more than 66 years; and

WHEREAS, Enbridge’s Line 5, a light crude and natural gas liquids pipeline, helps to safely meet Michigan’s energy needs by fulfilling more than half of the propane needs of the state; and

WHEREAS, the products delivered to regional refineries provide jobs and ultimately fuel our lives; and

WHEREAS, multiple and extensive inspections and safety tests over the last several years have confirmed the integrity of Line 5 at the Straits of Mackinac as fit for service.

WHEREAS, Consequences to energy supply, local producers, regional airports and refineries, jobs, local economies and the pocketbook of Michiganders across the entire state are too great for Line 5 to be shut down before the tunnel replacement can be completed.

WHEREAS, Issues have been raised by several concerned parties regarding the possibility and impact of a breach of Line 5 into the Straits of Mackinac. These concerns have resulted in the State of Michigan and Enbridge negotiating an “agreement” for a 5 year \$500 million project, to construct a tunnel 100 feet below bedrock to encase Line 5, the entire length of the Straits, in one-foot-thick concrete walls in order to mitigate chances of any leaks of product into the Great Lakes.

WHEREAS, the recently elected Michigan Attorney General, Dana Nessel has subsequently opposed the negotiated “agreement” and filed a law-suit in Ingham County Circuit Court to close down Line 5 immediately effectively canceling all efforts to begin construction of the tunnel; and

WHEREAS, this action may very well provide unintended consequents for all parties as the litigation to close down Line 5 may take years to be resolved in the courts with no assurance of the outcome and;

WHEREAS, the time to resolve the litigation may simply result in the delay of the start of the construction of the tunnel thereby leaving the existing Line 5 in place unnecessarily for several additional years.

WHEREAS, Enbridge has demonstrated a willingness to work with the state to both protect the Great Lakes and ensure the continued safe delivery of energy we all rely on.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Cheboygan County Board of Commissioners hereby joins with other Michigan Counties in extending its support for Enbridge’s proposed tunnel replacement project and urges the State of Michigan to work with Enbridge to complete the tunnel project as quickly as possible and not disrupt Line 5 service before the tunnel can be completed.

AND, BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that Cheboygan County sends this resolution to all counties of Michigan as an invitation to join in expressing support for increasing the safety of our current energy infrastructure as our society simultaneously seeks energy efficiencies and energy alternatives that will continue to reduce negative impacts and risks to our environment.

A roll call vote was taken. Motion carried with 5 yes, 2 no (Commissioner Gouine and Commissioner Newman) and 0 absent.

Board Matters for Discussion

Commissioner Sangster commented on the article in the Alpena News on the Health Department that was handed out. Discussion was held on what this Board could do to help with this issue. Commissioner Newman and Commissioner Gouine have brought this up in the past. Commissioner Newman commented that all they could do was to work with the other counties that support the individuals that were in place. He has not heard any complaints from any patients about their services. The employees feel that it is purely administrative. Sheriff Clarmont stated that due to this problem last year, the county was forced to sign a contract with a private company to provide these services to the inmates. Commissioner Newman would be attending the meetings with the health department that are scheduled to take place over the next couple of months and he would bring back any new information to the rest of the board.

CITIZENS COMMENTS

Leonard Page citizen of Grant Township commented on the resolution wording in sentence number five (5) and questioned the Board's decision to pass a resolution stating that the 66 year old line should keep pumping during the length of the tunnel being built. The tunnel build project has gone from 10 years last year to 5 to 7 years this year with delays permitted by technical difficulties and permit challenges. It was about letting Line 5 pump indefinitely subject to the next anchor drag in the straits.

Vince Lumetta citizen of Beaugrand Township thanked the two (2) Board members who voted against this resolution because it seemed they needed to collect more information. He was interested in the rest of the Boards decision to vote in favor of this resolution and he wanted to hear from his Commissioner. Commissioner Tryban commented that the Board respects the Great Lakes water and the Inland Water ways. She personally felt that the tunnel was the best alternative in this situation after reading various pros and cons articles on this issue. It is the best interest of Cheboygan County and the State of Michigan. Commissioner Warfield commented that the resolution speaks for itself.

Carl Muscott citizen of Tuscarora Township wanted to thank Commissioner Gouine and Commissioner Newman for their no vote. He commented that all these people that came out to oppose this resolution should realize that it was simply a resolution from Cheboygan County that would have no bearing on the ultimate decision that was made. Attorney General Nessel was presently suing Enbridge to try and stop the tunnel. Governor Whitmer has flipped flopped and has decided to support the tunnel. This should be all tied up in court for years. Enbridge will not shut down the line until there was a leak.

JoAnne Hite citizen of the City of Cheboygan commented that she has been reading the SEC reports for Enbridge and they have a duty to report to their investors of what their current and future projects were. The tunnel is not listed in the report to their shareholders. It does not make financial sense in terms of profit and loss for them to do it. This Board has done their bidding and has not done extensive research that they were responsible for. Enbridge has no intention of building that tunnel.

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

Commissioner Gouine commented that what the Board has done here has very little setback on the future of Line 5.

Commissioner Sangster commented on an issue that had been brought up a couple of times regarding Enbridge's situation with those anchors. Enbridge has applied for those permits and they were sitting in the State's hand. Enbridge could have had those repairs done a long time ago.

Commissioner Newman commented that he had a long conversation with State Representative Sue Allor and one of the things that stuck in his mind from that conversation was when they did have the anchor strike because of the severe weather in the straits it took several days for the pipe to be inspected. This speaks for Enbridge and their response and that great body of water.

Commissioner Matelski commented that she loves this area and the tunnel was the only way to go to keep the Great Lakes safe. She went along with this resolution to support the tunnel and not necessarily to support Line 5.

Commissioner Warfield commented that if the state were to move to shut down the existing Line 5 that ran under the straits, this would be tied up in court longer then it would be to construct the tunnel. At the end of the day, Line 5 is at the bottom of the straits, so we can either fight to get rid of it or accept that we were not going to get rid of it in a timely manner for which the tunnel could be constructed in. He stated the he was an outdoorsman and a conservationist, and he saw this as the best solution. Also he complimented this Board for passing this resolution.

Commissioner Wallace commented that this was the less complicated way to keep oil still going for the service of the public.

Motion by Commissioner Sangster seconded by Commissioner Tryban to adjourn to the call of the chairperson. Motion carried with 7 yes, 0 no and 0 absent. Meeting adjourned at 11:34 a.m.

Karen L. Brewster
Cheboygan County Clerk/Register

John B. Wallace
Chairperson