

**CHEBOYGAN COUNTY BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS
COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE MEETING
MARCH 22, 2016**

The regular meeting of the Cheboygan County Board of Commissioners was called to order in the Commissioners Room by Chairperson Pete Redmond at 9:30 a.m.

Roll called and a quorum present.

Present: Commissioners Chris Brown, Bruce Gauthier, Pete Redmond, Cal Gouine, Tony Matelski, John Wallace, and Sue Allor

Absent: None

Commissioner Wallace gave the invocation and led the Pledge of Allegiance.

Motion by Commissioner Allor, seconded by Commissioner Gouine, to approve the agenda as presented. Motion carried with 7 yes, 0 no and 0 absent.

CITIZENS COMMENTS

Roger Gauthier, a citizen of Benton Township, commented on the upcoming Enbridge presentation as a concerned citizen. Mr. Gauthier stated that his primary concern is that Enbridge has not properly prepared for spill into the Straits of Mackinaw and Lake Michigan and that Enbridge doesn't have enough insurance coverage – previously stated as \$700,000,000.

SCHEDULED VISITORS

Sheriff Dale Clarmont presented a Life Saving Award to Deputy Michael Swanson. Deputy Swanson has been a deputy for 28 years. Sheriff Clarmont stated that last August there was a luncheon hosted by the Cheboygan County Humane Society, a woman started choking at the luncheon, and Deputy Swanson performed the Heimlich maneuver and saved her life. Sheriff Clarmont thanked Deputy Swanson on behalf of the citizens of Cheboygan County and the Cheboygan County Sheriff's Department. Deputy Swanson thanked everyone for the award. Commissioner Redmond thanked Deputy Swanson on behalf of the Board of Commissioners.

Jason Manshum, a representative from Enbridge, to present information on Line 5. Mr. Manshum said that Enbridge started as a crude oil distributor, and has developed into a natural gas distributor and renewable energy developer. He stated Enbridge delivers 2.2 million barrels of oil a day into America and that petroleum is a lot more than fuel for our cars. Mr. Manshum noted in Michigan there are 4 crude oil pipelines and 1 natural gas pipeline. Mr. Manshum stated Line 5 is nearly 700 miles long – one pipeline in a network of pipelines. Mr. Manshum noted Enbridge pays \$22 million in property taxes annually throughout Michigan. He said Line 5 delivers “natural gas liquids” that is refined into propane to heat homes. He addressed a 2010 spill from Line 6b and stated that he knows the concerns from citizens regarding pipeline safety. He stated that Enbridge has invested the most money in its industry for technology and safety, that Line 5 is the most inspected pipeline in the system and that the company is on track to have zero spills. Mr. Manshum noted that pipes are monitored 24/7 and there has been a change in procedure for control center operators that if pressure drops in a pipe, the pipe will be shut down, an alarm will sound, and a live crew will go to the site and look for signs of a leak and only after that inspection will the pipe be restarted. Mr. Manshum stated Line 5 feeds the Marathon refinery in Lower Michigan. He said that previous to the past few years, pipelines were out of sight, out of mind, but they have become of high interest nationally and citizens have become more intuitive and there is aversion to oil resources in general. He said it's good that there has been increased interest in what's under our feet and in our Straits because we all depend on the resources provided through

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE – March 22, 2016

Enbridge. Mr. Manshum stated that the pipeline is 65 years old and Enbridge has coated the steel pipe with a series of protections to maintain the shelf life of the pipe. Mr. Manshum noted that every pipeline they own has a threshold for maintenance and when the pipe comes to a certain point, Enbridge addresses repairing or replacing the pipe. Line 5 is not near that maintenance threshold. He stated that inspections occur on the pipes inside and outside the pipes – underwater crews visually inspect the pipes based on data readings from inside the pipes and helicopter crews visually inspect the waters for signs of oil spills every other week. Line 5 is a service to Michigan for fuel, heat and beyond and crude oil is delivered in a safe and reliable manner. Mr. Manshum stated that Enbridge is providing more and more data and developing more analysis to satisfy citizen questions. He said when it comes to energy and what we use on a daily basis no one should have to choose between using that energy and protecting the environment – people should have both. Commissioner Allor asked if any of the sections under the Straits have been replaced. Mr. Manshum said there have been spots on the pipeline that have been repaired, but not replaced. Enbridge representative provided an example piece of the pipeline that's under the Straits to demonstrate its thickness. Commissioner Gauthier asked about what point would Enbridge transition from a focus on crude and natural oil to renewable energy. Mr. Manshum stated it's not a clear point; but that the energy that is delivered is based on need and that there is still a tremendous demand on fossil fuels. Commissioner Gauthier asked if the comment regarding Line 5 pipeline being shut down in 3 minutes in an emergency has been tested. Another Enbridge representative answered, stating that all the valves in the Straits of Mackinac have been designed to shut down within 3 minutes, it is a gradual process and is tested every 6 months. Commissioner Gauthier asked what percentage of the spill on Line 6b has been recovered. Mr. Manshum stated that clean up finished just over a year ago and it was done with the oversight and collaboration of the EPA and the State of Michigan. He said 90% was removed off the river before 2010 was over using traditional methods of cleanup and that 90% was repurposed. Mr. Manshum stated that the remaining 10% is what they have focused on in the last 6 years and it is nearly all eradicated with some microscopic particles in the sediment that are not harmful. Commissioner Gauthier asked how much oil would spill into the Straits of Mackinac in the 3 minutes it would take to shut down Line 5 in an emergency. Mr. Manshum said that worst case scenario – a probability of close to impossible as tested – would be approximately 4500-4900 barrels. Commissioner Matelski asked about the issue with the Line 6b spill being the manual restarts based on a drop in pressure in the pipe and what would be the normal range of pressure fluctuations in Line 5. Mr. Manshum stated that every pipeline gets tested in various ways, and one test is hydrostatic test that puts water in a pipe and applies more pressure than would ever be pushed with oil. Mr. Manshum stated that the hydrostatic test on pipes applied 1700 pounds per square inch and the maximum pressure that they could every apply with oil is 1200 pounds per square inch the line. Mr. Manshum said in the Straits of Mackinac, the line operates at about 100 pounds per square inch of pressure. Another Enbridge representative said the normal fluctuation is plus or minus 5 pounds of pressure. Commissioner Matelski asked about the supports under the Line 5 pipe under the Straits of Mackinac and that more supporting cradles were added and he was wondering why. Mr. Manshum responded that the pipe is on the bottom of the lake, not buried under the sediment and as sediment washed out under the pipe they added more permanent supports where there was previous just sandbag supports. Mr. Manshum stated 102 supports were added by Enbridge between 2002 and 2014. In 2016, divers and vehicles are going underwater again and looking for areas of 75 feet without supports to add more if necessary. Commissioner Allor asked if Enbridge has assessed how much damage would occur if the “worst case scenario” of 4500-4900 barrels of oil ruptured into the Straits of Mackinac. Mr. Manshum stated that Enbridge has analyzed that damage in the exercise last fall and there is a response plan which helps dictate how the area would respond in the field and not just on paper. Mr. Manshum said that Enbridge is collaborating with NOAA, and local agencies. Commissioner Allor asked about a spill in February when there's ice. Mr. Manshum said that the time before last fall when Enbridge exercised was in January 2012. A Enbridge representative stated that there are vetted vessels and ice equipment, Coast Guard and open water recovery as tested last September – they are putting all people and resources together. Commissioner Allor asked if the equipment is located in the Straits Area. A Enbridge representative stated that they are trying to get equipment in the

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE – March 22, 2016

Straits but it is identified in location around the Great Lakes. Commissioner Matelski asked if it would be possible if there was a leak in the Straits to turn the pressure off on the North side and turn it up on the South side and create a negative flow to suck the oil back in the pipe. An Enbridge representative stated that it would be possible to a certain extent. Commissioner Brown asked if there are any other stations in Lower Michigan that the natural gas liquid product gets delivered to. Mr. Manshum stated that the two closes exits on the pipe for natural gas liquids are Rapid River, MI in the Upper Peninsula and Sarnia, Ontario that services the Lower Peninsula.

Prosecutor Daryl Vizina presented the 2015 Annual Report for the Cheboygan County Prosecutor's Office. Prosecutor Vizina noted there is a new Assistant Prosecuting Attorney in the office, Alfred Feleppa, who is a former elected prosecutor in Mackinac County. Prosecutor Vizina highlighted several important cases prosecuted in 2015. He reviewed the general operations and caseload information for the office. Prosecutor Vizina reported Cheboygan County experiences the highest number of cases per attorney in this region. Discussion was held and questions from the Board were addressed by the Prosecutor. When asked by Commissioner Gauthier, the Prosecutor stated that lack of education, unemployment and a history of drug abuse is the general profile of felony offenders.

ADMINISTRATOR'S REPORT

Administrator Lawson stated that the Veterans Services Officer position has been offered to Mr. Richard Wiles. Mr. Wiles is scheduled to start at the end of March and will be introduced to the Board at the first meeting in April.

Administrator Lawson stated that C.C.E. 9-1-1 is doing research on 800-radios for their strength in the region. He said they will also provide a cost analysis for switching over all the radios, which could be quite expensive, but maybe eligible for grant funding. Sheriff Clarmont clarified that the Sheriff's Deputies already carry 800-radios.

OLD BUSINESS – None

NEW BUSINESS – None

BOARD MATTERS FOR DISCUSSION – None

CITIZENS COMMENTS

Dr. Timm presented his comments on Letters to the Editor written by Blake Olson, Enbridge Representative, in response to his presentation to the Board of Commissioners regarding Enbridge Line 5.

Anabel Dwyer, a citizen of Mackinaw Township and a member of the group Concerned Citizens for Peace and Justice thanked the Board for previously passing the Enbridge Line 5 Resolution and commented that it has been helpful in their efforts to gain state and federal support to have Enbridge only transport non-oil products in Line 5 under security of the pipe is proven. Commissioner Wallace asked what non-oil products she was referring to. Ms. Dwyer responded that she is referring to Natural Gas Liquids (NGLs).

Vincent Lumetta, a citizen of Beaugrand Township, commented on the Enbridge presentation and is glad to hear that Enbridge is taking pipeline safety seriously. Mr. Lumetta commented on certain points of the Enbridge presentation and spill statistics on pipelines in America. Mr. Lumetta commented that he is not against pipelines personally but is concerned about vintage pipeline safety in the environment.

Carl Muscott, a citizen of Tuscarora Township, commented on the use of the Cheboygan County Marina by Cheboygan County citizens. Discussion was held.

COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE – March 22, 2016

BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

Commissioner Wallace commented that he put a “report card” regarding Michigan Works on each Commissioner’s desks.

Commissioner Brown asked if there was a time and place set for the Board planning session. Commissioner Redmond stated that the Administrator has been looking at different locations. Administrator Lawson said they have not concluded yet but they are considering Audie’s and UAW Center. Discussion was held about holding the meeting in accordance with the Open Meetings Act.

Commissioner Matelski asked if someone from the State could come and make a presentation about why Cheboygan County should keep the marina open. Commissioner Redmond stated the Administrator could research what the county’s responsibilities and financial obligation would be if the facility were to be turned over to the state.

Commissioner Brown stated that the marina was originally built with DNR Trust Fund money, not tax dollars so by law it cannot be used for any other use than parks and recreation. Discussion was held.

Commissioner Gouine commented that people who stay at the county marina shop in Cheboygan.

Motion by Commissioner Matelski, seconded by Commissioner Wallace, to adjourn to the call of the Chair. Motion carried. Meeting adjourned at 11:49 AM.

Mary Ellen Tryban
County Clerk/Register

Pete Redmond
Chairperson